

Logic and Argumentation

70
Studies
in Logic

Argumentation and Inference

**Proceedings of the
2nd European Conference
on Argumentation,
Fribourg 2017
Volume I**

Editors
Steve Oswald
Didier Maillat

This is Volume I of the proceedings of the 2nd European Conference on Argumentation: Argumentation and Inference, held at the University of Fribourg, Switzerland, in June 2017. The European Conference on Argumentation (ECA) is an established pan-European initiative aiming to consolidate and advance various streaks of research into argumentation and reasoning: philosophy, communication, linguistics, discourse analysis, computer science, psychology, cognitive studies, legal theory, etc. These proceedings reflect the current state of the art of argumentation scholarship across these disciplines and, as such, are a testimony to the vigour of the field. A majority of contributions presented in these volumes frontally tackle the conference theme, thereby offering a valuable and focused discussion on various aspects of inference and on its role in argumentative practices to scholars interested in the topic but also, more broadly, in argumentation theory.



ISBN 978-1-84890-283-1



9 781848 902831

Studies in Logic
Logic and Argumentation
Volume 76

Argumentation and Inference
Proceedings of the 2nd European
Conference on Argumentation
Volume I

Volume 66

Logical Consequences. Theory and Applications: An Introduction.

Luis M. Augusto

Volume 67

Many-Valued Logics: A Mathematical and Computational Introduction

Luis M. Augusto

Volume 68

Argument Technologies: Theory, Analysis, and Applications

Floris Bex, Floriana Grasso, Nancy Green, Fabio Paglieri and

Chris Reed, eds

Volume 69

Logic and Conditional Probability. A Synthesis

Philip Calabrese

Volume 70

Proceedings of the International Conference. Philosophy, Mathematics,
Linguistics: Aspects of Interaction, 2012 (PhML-2012)

Oleg Prossorov, ed.

Volume 71

Fathoming Formal Logic: Volume I. Theory and Decision Procedures for
Propositional Logic

Odysseus Makridis

Volume 72

Fathoming Formal Logic: Volume II. Semantics and Proof Theory for
Predicate Logic

Odysseus Makridis

Volume 73

Measuring Inconsistency in Information

John Grant and Maria Vanina Martinez, eds.

Volume 74

Dictionary of Argumentation. An Introduction to Argumentation Studies

Christian Plantin. With a Foreword by J. Anthony Blair

Volume 75

Theory of Effective Propositional Paraconsistent Logics

Arnon Avron, Ofer Arieli and Anna Zamansky

Volume 76

Argumentation and Inference. Proceedings of the 2nd European Conference
on Argumentation. Volume I

Steve Oswald and Didier Maillat, eds.

Volume 77

Argumentation and Inference. Proceedings of the 2nd European Conference
on Argumentation. Volume II

Steve Oswald and Didier Maillat, eds.

Studies in Logic Series Editor

Dov Gabbay

dov.gabbay@kcl.ac.uk

Argumentation and Inference
Proceedings of the 2nd European
Conference on Argumentation
Volume II

Edited by
Steve Oswald
and
Didier Maillat

© Individual author and College Publications, 2018
All rights reserved.

ISBN 978-1-84890-283-1

College Publications
Scientific Director: Dov Gabbay
Managing Director: Jane Spurr

<http://www.collegepublications.co.uk>

Printed by Lightning Source, Milton Keynes, UK

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form, or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without prior permission, in writing, from the publisher.

Table of contents

Long papers and commentaries

1. The Appraisal of Conductions.....	1
<i>Lilian Bermejo-Luque</i>	
Commentary by Paula Olmos.....	19
2. In Defence of Conduction: Two Neglected Features of29	
argumentation	
<i>J. Anthony Blair</i>	
Commentary by Jean Wagemans.....	45
3. French Interpersonal Argument: Fundamental Understandings51	
<i>Michel Dufour & Dale Hample</i>	
Commentary by Marta Zampa.....	75
4. Inferences, Inference Rules, Generalized Conditionals,.....79	
Adequate Connections	
<i>James B. Freeman</i>	
Commentary by Juho Ritola.....	101
5. Virtuous Arguers: Responsible and Reliable 105	
<i>José Ángel Gascón</i>	
Commentary by Andrew Aberdein.....	123
6. Emotional Inference: Making, Using, and 129	
Transparency in Argumentative Contexts	
<i>Michael A. Gilbert</i>	
7. Analysing Implicit Premises Within Children's 147	
Argumentative Inferences	
<i>Sara Greco, Anne-Nelly Perret-Clermont, Antonio Iannaccone,</i>	
<i>Andrea Rocci, Josephine Convertini & Rebecca Schär</i>	
Commentary by Chrysi Rapanta.....	169
8. Sound Arguments: An Introduction To Auditory Argument 177	
<i>Leo Groarke & Gabrijela Kišiček</i>	
Commentary by Jean Goodwin.....	199
9. On Arguments From Testimony 203	
<i>Martin Hinton</i>	
Commentary by David Godden	221

10. Fostering Reflection And Self-Correcting Reasoning.....	231
With Deliberation And Argument Visualization Systems	
<i>Michael H. G. Hoffmann</i>	
Commentary by Michael J. Hoppmann.....	253
11. On How To Do Without The Opening Stage: Arguers	261
And Argumentation Theorists Can Get Along Without It	
<i>Scott Jacobs</i>	
Commentary by Erik C. W. Krabbe	279
12. In The Quagmire Of Quibbles.....	283
<i>Erik C. W. Krabbe & Jan Albert van Laar</i>	
Commentary by Marcin Lewiński	305
13. Strength Of Justification. The Rational Degree Of	315
Certainty Approach	
<i>Christoph Lumer</i>	
Commentary by Niki Pfeifer	335
14. Lucie Olbrechts-Tyteca's <i>Le Comique Du Discours</i> : Humour.....	341
And Argument As Rhetorical	
<i>Michael Phillips-Anderson & Noemi Marin</i>	
Commentary by Christopher W. Tindale	359
15. Informal Logic's Infinite Regress: Inference Through A.....	365
Looking-Glass	
<i>Gilbert Plumer</i>	
Commentary by Daniel H. Cohen.....	379
16. On Coherent Arguments And Their Inferential Roles.....	385
<i>Bart Verheij</i>	
Commentary by Mathieu Beirlaen.....	405
17. Strategic Manuevering In The Background: How Candidates.....	411
Encourage Audience Inference Making Through	
Silent Derogation In The Background	
<i>Harry Weger, Jr. & Dima Mohammed</i>	
Commentary by Francisca Snoeck Henkemans	435
18. Perception, Inference, And Understanding In Visual.....	439
Argumentation (And Beyond)	
<i>Igor Ž. Žagar</i>	

19. Can Bayesian Models Have “Normative Pull” On Human Reasoners?	469
<i>Frank Zenker</i>	
Commentary by Hans V. Hansen	479

Thematic Panels

Panel I: Narratives and Arguments

I.1 Narrative Reasons In Scientific Argument	485
<i>Paula Olmos</i>	
I.2 Narratives And Analogies: Homage To Miss Marple	505
<i>Tone Kvernbekk</i>	
I.3 Two Epistemic Issues For A Narrative Argument Structure	519
<i>Gilbert Plumer</i>	
I.4 Mythical Arguments	527
<i>Christopher W. Tindale</i>	

Panel II: Taxonomic Approaches to Argument and Inference Types

II.1 Thirty Years After: Towards A Typology Of Argument Schemes	539
<i>Manfred Kienpointner</i>	
II.2 Classifying And Combining Argumentation Schemes For Representing Real Arguments	555
<i>Fabrizio Macagno</i>	
II.3 Assertoric Syllogistic And The <i>Periodic Table Of Arguments</i>	573
<i>Jean H. M. Wagemans</i>	
II.4 Towards A Chemical Taxonomy For Types Of Arguments And Inferences	589
<i>Michael J. Hoppmann</i>	
II.5 From Theory To Practice: The Annotation Of Argument Schemes	603
<i>Elena Musi, Mark Aakhus, Smaranda Muresan, Andrea Rocci & Manfred Stede</i>	

Preface

After a successful first edition held in Lisbon in 2015, ECA was hosted in 2017 by the Department of English at the University of Fribourg, Switzerland, 20-23 June 2017. These two volumes contain the proceedings of this second edition of the conference series, whose special theme was 'Argumentation and Inference'.

The European Conference on Argumentation (ECA) is a pan-European biennial initiative aiming to consolidate and advance various strands of research on argumentation and reasoning by gathering scholars from a range of disciplines. While based in Europe, ECA involves and encourages participation from argumentation scholars all over the world and welcomes submissions linked to argumentation studies in general in addition to those tackling the conference theme. While the first edition of ECA was devoted to exploring the relationship between argumentation and the decisions that follow from it, the 2017 Fribourg edition focused on the cognitive processes involved in argumentation, with a clear focus on inference as one of the key features of the argumentative process. Argumentation studies have increasingly expanded over the last decades with a clear opening towards cognitive science, and the 2017 edition of the conference accordingly facilitated a platform to stimulate a discussion in the community around the notion of inference, along its formal, social and cognitive dimensions.

Judging by its size (more than 200 participants in each of the first two editions), it is fair to consider that ECA has successfully reached its role as a key platform of scholarly exchange in the field of argumentation. The contents of these two volumes can accordingly be regarded as a reflection of the current state of the art in argumentation scholarship.

The proceedings contain papers which were accepted based on abstract submissions; each paper was thoroughly evaluated by three reviewers of our scientific board (for a full list of ECA committees, see www.ecargument.org). Volume I gathers 19 long papers and associated commentaries, together with 9 papers presented in two thematic panels that were held during ECA2017. Volume II gathers 68 regular papers that were presented during the conference.

All great events owe their success to the work and dedication of a number of people; this was also obviously the case for ECA2017. We thus want to take this opportunity to warmly thank all members of our Scientific Panel for their invaluable academic support and work. We express our gratitude to the members of the Programme Committee of ECA2017 for coordinating such a great display of argumentative scholarship. The people over at ARTEFACT have been immensely helpful in the administrative planning and coordination of the conference, which

x

is why we thank them for all the work done, in a great atmosphere. The organisers also thank the Fribourg team of student assistants, who did an impeccable job in welcoming, informing and assisting participants over these 4 days. We kept the most important expression of gratitude for last: we cannot sufficiently stress how precious, helpful and dedicated the work of Christiane Porzig has been regarding the collected papers you are holding in your hands: she is truly the one to thank for completing these massive volumes.

The next edition of ECA will take place in Groningen in 2019 and we are very much looking forward to seeing you there.

Steve Oswald and Didier Maillat
Fribourg, July 2018